City of Falcon Heights Environment Commission

City Hall 2077 Larpenteur Avenue W.

Monday, May 9, 2022 6:30 p.m.

AGENDA

A. CALL TO ORDER: 6:30 p.m.

B. ROLL CALL:

Martin McCleery ____ Esha Seth ____ John Pellegrini____ Council Liaison Meyer ____ Patrick Mathwig ____ Pedro De Filippo Vannucci____ Amy Christiansen____ Staff Liaison Moretto ____

C. APPROVAL OF MINUTES:

- D. AGENDA
 - 1. Recycling Presentation
 - 2. Climate Action Plan Review and Recommendation to Council
 - 3. Discuss No Mow May and Recommendation to Council

E. NEWS AND ANNOUNCEMENTS

1. Other

F. ADJOURN

Next Meeting: June 13, 2022

If you have a disability and need accommodation in order to attend this meeting, please notify City Hall 48 hours in advance between the hours of 8:00 a.m. and 4:30 p.m. at 651-792-7600. We will be happy to help.



Memorandum

8550 Hudson Boulevard North Eagle Point Office Center II, Suite 105 Lake Elmo, MN 55042 (651) 288-8550 foth.com

May 5, 2022

- TO: Paul Moretto, Community Development Coordinator / City Planner, City of Falcon Heights Filsan Ibrahim, Jennifer Nguyen Moore, Ramsey County
- CC: Cami Van Abel, Foth Infrastructure & Environment, LLC (Foth)
- FR: Dan Krivit, Foth
- RE: Analysis of the Tennis Recycling Contract Extension Proposal as Submitted to the City of Falcon Heights

Introduction

Tennis Sanitation, LLC (Tennis) is the current recycling collection services contractor for the City of Falcon Heights (City). The services include weekly, single-stream, curbside collection of traditional recyclables at single unit and multi-unit dwellings, and collections of recyclables and trash at City Hall. The contract is scheduled to end on December 31, 2022. This service does not include trash collection. The City has an "open hauling" system for trash collection, whereby residents contract directly with a licensed hauler.

The original contract was issued after a competitive request for proposals (RFP) procurement process conducted in 2015. Tennis began collections effective January 1, 2016. The recycling contract was extended in 2018 for a four-year period from January 1, 2019 through December 31, 2022.

On November 1, 2021, Tennis submitted a proposal to the City for a second, four-year extension for the period beginning January 1, 2023 through December 31, 2026.¹ The City is considering options including to negotiate with Tennis based on their proposed extension or initiate a new RFP process.

On April 19, 2022, City staff met with Ramsey County and Foth staff to discuss the Tennis proposal for a contract extension and the option to go out for RFP. County and City staff requested Foth conduct an analysis of the Tennis proposal for recycling collection services, including price comparisons to other comparable Ramsey County cities' recycling contract prices. Foth's consultant services are being provided to the City through the Ramsey County Technical Assistance Program (TAP).

Findings About Recycling Service Standards

City staff report the recycling collection services provided by Tennis during the past six+ years have been satisfactory. In 2018, the City approved a contract extension of recycling collection services by Tennis for an additional four years (2019 through 2022).

Based on information of the local recycling collection industry, Tennis provides a high level of recycling services including the following standards:

¹ Tennis Sanitation letter of proposed "Contract Extension Agreement between the City of Falcon Heights and Tennis Sanitation, LLC" (November 1, 2021).

pw:\\foth-pw.bentley.com:foth-pw-01\Documents\Clients\Ramsey Co PH MN\0022R003.00\10300 Draft Documents\ Falcon Heights 2022 Recycling Contract\M-Falcon Heights' Recycling Contract Analysis - Final 5-5-2022.docx

- Single-stream collection of all traditional recyclables (such as paper, cans, glass and plastic) collected in commingled format in one curbside recycling cart (equipped with wheels and a lid). Tennis also includes collection of textiles.
- Tennis provides weekly curbside recycling service. Some cities elect to contract for every-otherweek recycling collection to help save on recycling prices.
- Both trash and recyclables collection occur on Fridays each week. This "same day" collection schedule is generally more convenient for residents and helps them remember their trash/recyclable collection day.
- Tennis utilizes fully automated side-loading recycling trucks that pick up and tips the cart using a robotic arm. This improves collection efficiency and is safer for the Contractor's collection crew compared to manual or semi-automated cart lifting systems.
- Tennis owns and manages the recycling carts. This approach avoids City ownership of carts which requires some form of City financing. (Note: If the City elects to own the recycling carts, Ramsey County has a grant program that may fund up to 50% of the recycling carts to help offset some of these costs.)
- Tennis provides recyclables processing at their materials recovery facility (MRF) located in St. Paul Park. The is no "risk/revenue sharing" provision in the contract; Tennis takes on all of the market risk during periods of low recyclables prices, but also does not provide a financial share back to City during periods of high recyclables prices.
- Tennis takes a pro-active approach in implementing most public education services such as the City-specific annual recycling brochure for Falcon Heights.²
- Resident inquiries, missed pick-ups, and cart repairs/placement are managed by Tennis. Residents are instructed to call Tennis directly for these and other customer service issues.
- Tennis provides a comprehensive annual recycling report that summarizes recyclables tonnages, resident participation rates, important program changes, recycling market conditions, environmental impacts, and other information.³
- Tennis provides recyclables and trash collection services for City Hall at no additional charge to the City.

Price Analysis

Below is a detailed analysis of Tennis' proposed recycling contract extension pricing and how the proposed price compares to the current contract and to selected other comparable Ramsey County cities with recycling contracts.

Tennis' Proposed Prices

Table 1 lists the historical, current, and proposed recycling prices as charged by Tennis to the City in \$ per household (HH) per month for weekly collection. Over the past seven years, the recycling contract included two price changes: +\$0.25/HH/month each for 2019 and for 2021. This equates to an eight percent increase from 2018 to 2019 and 2020 to 2021.

Table 1

Falcon Heights Recycling Contract Prices – Weekly Service (Prices are in \$ per household per month)

² Tennis Sanitation "2022 Recycling Brochure" for Falcon Heights

³ Tennis Sanitation "2021 Year End Recycling Report" for Falcon Heights

Contract Period:	Original Contract Period				First Extension			Proposed Second Extension			
Year Number:	1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	9	10	11
Year:	2016	2017	2018	2019	2020	2021	2022	2023	2024	2025	2026
Price (\$/HH/Month)	\$3.00	\$3.00	\$3.00	\$3.25	\$3.25	\$3.25	\$3.50	\$4.50	\$4.75	\$5.25	
Percent Increase		0%	0%	8%	0%	8%	0%	29%	6%	11%	

Note: --- = Data not provided in proposed extension.

Sources: Tennis Sanitation original contract (2016 - 2018), first Extension (2019 - 2022), and Tennis-proposed 2023 - 2026 Contract Extension (as submitted on November 1, 2021)

Prepared by: DFK Checked by: CAV

The Tennis-proposed, second Contract Extension shows an annual average increase of 15% from the current 2022 price \$3.50 per household per month for the three years (years 8 to 10).

There is no price difference in the Tennis recycling contract for single family vs. multi-unit dwellings.

The Saint Paul Regional Water Services administers utility and recycling billing for the City.

Comparison of Prices to Other Ramsey County Cities

Comparing recycling prices between cities is challenged by many variables that affect both cost of operations and competitive pricing in the marketplace. The goal of any such price analysis should be to attempt to portray a fair, transparent, and repeatable "apples to apples" comparison to the extent possible.

The following four variables should be kept in mind when reviewing rate comparisons:

- Weekly vs. every-other-week recyclables collection frequency.
- Contractor owned vs. city owned recycling carts.
- "Bundled" trash + recycling contract vs. recycling only contract. Generally, bundled trash + recycling contracts have higher recycling prices due to a common industry practice adjusting rates for recycling prices to save on the state and county taxes.
- Is there a "risk/revenue sharing" provision for recyclables in the contract? Or, does the contractor take on all of the risk and not share any revenue from sale of recyclables depending on the state of the recycling market?

Comparison to Other Cities

The City of Maplewood also has a 5.5-year recycling contract with Tennis for weekly service. Tennis owns the carts. Recycling is a separate contract from the city's trash contract with another company. Table 2 displays the City of Maplewood's curbside recycling contract prices. Table 2 prices were proposed by Tennis in response to the City of Maplewood's RFP released in 2019. Residential pickup includes single unit dwellings and multi-unit dwellings. There is no risk/revenue sharing provision in the contract. The average annual increase in price over the six-year period is 5.6 percent.

Table 2 Maplewood's Recycling Contract Price – Weekly Service (Prices are in \$ per household per month)

Year Number:	1	2	3	4	5	6
Year:	2020	2021	2022	2023	2024	2025 (1 st half)
Price (\$/HH/Month)	\$4.00	\$4.25	\$4.50	\$4.75	\$5.00	\$5.25
Percent Increase		6.3%	5.9%	5.6%	5.3%	5.0%

The City of Roseville has a 3.5-year recycling contract with Eureka Recycling for every-other-week service. Eureka owns the carts. The City has an open trash hauling system. Table 3 displays the City of Roseville's current recycling contract prices. Residential pickup includes single unit dwellings and multi-unit dwellings. There is no risk/revenue sharing provision in the contract. The average annual increase in price over the six-year period is 3.5 percent. It is important to note that Roseville elected to purchase every other week service. In response to the City's 2021 RFP, Eureka proposed comparable weekly prices that were 31% higher than their every other week price shown in Table 3.

Table 3
Roseville's Recycling Contract Price – Every Other Week Service
(Prices are in \$ per household per month)

Year Number:	1	2	3	4
Year:	2022	2023	2024	2025 (1 st half)
Price (\$/HH/Month)	\$3.98	\$4.12	\$4.26	\$4.41
Percent Increase		3.5%	3.4%	3.5%

Source: City of Roseville's recycling contract with Eureka (Executed July 26, 2021)

Prepared by: DFK Checked by: CAV

The City of Lauderdale has a 5-year recycling contract with Eureka Recycling for weekly service. The City owns the carts. The City has an open trash hauling system. Table 4 displays the City of Lauderdale's recycling contract prices. Residential pickup includes single unit dwellings and multi-unit dwellings. There is no risk/revenue sharing provision in the contract. The average annual increase in price over the six-year period is 1.9 percent.

Table 4 Lauderdale's Recycling Contract Price – Weekly Service (Prices are in \$ per household per month)

Year Number:	1	2	3	4	5
Year:	2019	2020	2021	2022	2023
Price (\$/HH/Month)	\$5.65	\$5.76	\$5.87	5.98	6.09
Percent Increase		1.9%	1.9	1.9	1.8

Source: City of Lauderdale's recycling contract with Eureka (Executed December 2018)

Prepared by: DFK Checked by: CAV

Conclusions and Observations

Several conclusions and observations can be drawn from this analysis.

- 1. The original Falcon Heights recycling contract with Tennis became effective January 1, 2016.
- 2. Falcon Heights negotiated one, four-year extension to its original recycling contract with Tennis. The current term of the Falcon Heights Tennis contract is scheduled to expire on December 31, 2022.
- 3. The City and its residents have received a high level of recycling service from Tennis when compared to current industry standards in the Twin Cities Metropolitan Area and Ramsey County in particular.

- 4. Tennis submitted a written proposal for a four-year contract extension on November 1, 2021. The City may wish to ask Tennis additional questions to clarify their proposal (e.g., proposed prices for 2025 and 2026).
- 5. Comparisons to three other cities' residential solid waste and recycling prices were conducted in this memorandum. The Tennis proposed prices for 2023 to 2026 appear to be very competitive.

A RESOLUTION DECLARING A CLIMATE EMERGENCY AND THE COMMITMENT OF FALCON HEIGHTS TO TAKE ACTION

WHEREAS the climate crisis is not only a future issue — it is affecting us here and now in Falcon Heights. Our city has recently experienced numerous climate change related impacts including a record June heatwave, dangerous air quality from drought-fueled forest fires, and water restrictions from the same drought. In fact, <u>the ten warmest and wettest years ever</u> recorded in Minnesota have all occurred since 1998. Impacts like warming surface waters are leading to a significant loss of fish habitats in our lakes as well as increasing the risk of harmful algae blooms, and our forests are changing as native northern species are strained by warming temperatures;

WHEREAS extreme weather will bring greater challenges to the local infrastructure of Falcon Heights, imposing escalating economic burdens on our residents and businesses; crops are stressed by cycles of drought and floods, home insurance rates are rapidly rising, costing homeowners an extra \$1000 on average in 2015 compared to rates in 1998, and faster warming winters are leading to new pests as well as shorter winter recreation seasons;

WHEREAS the greatest burden from an inadequate response to the climate crisis is most immediately experienced by historically marginalized or underserved communities, due to the lasting impact of segregation, the close proximity to pollution sources, and the lack of resources to deal with such challenges;

WHEREAS the failure to act will lead to the inheritance of these hardships to the youngest generation, including the children and grandchildren of Falcon Heights;

WHEREAS the bipartisan Next Generation Energy Act, passed by the Minnesota State Legislature and signed by then-Governor Tim Pawlenty in 2007, committed our state to achieving an 80% reduction in greenhouse gas (GHG) emissions by 2050 and with interim goals of 15% and 30% below 2005 GHG emissions levels by 2015 and 2025, respectively, with cities being key drivers of achieving these goals; Minnesota did not meet the 2015 target and is not on track to reach our future targets;

WHEREAS world leaders from 175 countries, including the United States, following the guidance of the Intergovernmental Panel on Climate Change, recognized the threat of climate change and the urgent need to combat it by signing the 2015 Paris Agreement, agreeing to "pursue efforts to limit the temperature increase to 1.5 degrees Celsius", which would require emissions to be halved by 2030 and reaching net-zero or net negative carbon emissions by 2050;

WHEREAS due primarily to human activities we have already reached a temperature increase of nearly <u>1.19 degrees Celsius (nearly 2.14 degrees Fahrenheit) as compared to pre-industrial times</u> and the death and destruction already wrought by this level of global warming

demonstrates that the Earth is already too hot for safety and justice, as attested by increased and intensifying wildfires, floods, rising seas, diseases, droughts, and extreme weather;

WHEREAS a transition to a clean energy economy, if not carefully planned, would have a disruptive economic and social impact for many in our community while a well-planned transition may provide expanded job opportunities for local residents, improve local air quality, quality of life, and provide economic stability;

WHEREAS to focus attention on the need for rapid action to address climate change, 2,012 jurisdictions in 34 nations have already declared climate emergencies, including19 cities across Minnesota, led by Duluth, Minneapolis, and Saint Louis Park, and report that acting together, connecting to a larger statewide effort is empowering and;

NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED that the City of Falcon Heights declares that a climate emergency threatens our city, region, state, nation, humanity, and the natural world. The City commits to working for a just transition and climate emergency mobilization effort by creating and executing a Climate Action Plan.



REQUEST FOR COUNCIL ACTION

Meeting Date	May 11, 2022
Agenda Item	D3
Attachment	N/A
Submitted By	Jack Linehan
	City Administrator
	-

Item	Support for No Mow May
Description	No Mow May is an initiative to encourage residents who wish to participate to not mow their lawns during the month of May to allow pollinators, particularly bees, additional time to safely come out of hibernation in tall grasses and weeds. To accomplish this goal, the City will need to temporarily suspend enforcement of Sec. 22-19 and Sec. 22-21 of the City Code, which requires weeds and grass to be kept under 6" at all times. The attached resolution provides temporarily relief of this restriction for weeds and grass for a period that lasts through May 31, 2022. Beginning June 1, 2022, the City will begin once again enforcing ordinances related to mowing. The proposed resolution would not preempt the Minnesota State Stat. 18.77, which requires properties to manage noxious weeds/vegetation. Noxious weeds/vegetation will need to continue to be maintained on all properties per statute. In 2022, a number of Minnesota cities have adopted No Mow May resolutions including Edina, Mendota Heights, Vadnais Heights, Columbia Heights, West St. Paul, New Brighton, and Roseville. The language in the attached Resolution was modeled after other successful No Mow May programs in these nearby communities and it was reviewed by the City Attorney to confirm enforceability.
	As part of the No Mow May program, we will be seeking data from residents to determine if grass and weeds grow over six inches in the month of May. This will vary year-to-year, but can help determine if a more permanent City Code change may be applicable.
Budget Impact	
Attachment(s)	• Resolution 22-XX Supporting the No Mow May initiative 2022 by temporarily suspending the regulation requirements of Sec. 22-19 and Sec. 22-21 of the City Code for a period ending May 31, 2022.

Action(s)	Staff recommends approval of the attached resolution to support No Mow May.
Requested	

CITY OF FALCON HEIGHTS COUNCIL RESOLUTION

May 11, 2022

No. 22-<mark>XX</mark>

RESOLUTION SUPPORTING THE NO MOW MAY INITIATIVE 2022 BY TEMPORARILY SUSPENDING THE REGULATION REQUIREMENTS OF SEC. 22-19 AND SEC. 22-21 OF THE CITY CODE FOR A PERIOD ENDING MAY 31, 2022

WHEREAS, the City Council and the Environment Commission have an ongoing commitment to protect the environment and the natural habitat within the City; and

WHEREAS, the City Council and the Environment Commission recognize the importance of bees and other pollinators in the process of growing a diverse and healthy ecosystem; and

WHEREAS, recent research suggests that bee pollinators make use of no mow spaces as key floral resources during early spring in the upper Midwest United States; and

WHEREAS, pollinators and floral resources have a positive relationship, where the increase in pollinators can increase the amount of flora and vice versa; and

WHEREAS, the Falcon Heights City Council and the Environment Commission finds it is in the public interest and consistent with adopted City policies, including the City's Beekeeping Ordinance 20-05, for the City to demonstrate its commitment to a safe and healthy community environment through the implementation of initiatives that help increase the pollinator population.

NOW THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED by the City Council of the City of Falcon Heights, Minnesota:

- 1. To proclaim the remainder of May 2022 as No Mow May, and encourage all residents of the city who wish to participate this initiative to refrain from mowing their lawns in the month of May to provide vital early spring flowers for bees that emerge from hibernation, and
- 2. To temporarily suspend enforcement for No Mow May relating to the requirements of Sec. 22-19 and Sec. 22-21, specifically that "...weeds or grass growing to a height of greater than six inches" from a period beginning May 12, 2022 to May 31, 2022, while continuing to enforce the Minnesota State Mandate regarding the management of noxious weeds, and
- 3. Beginning on June 1, 2022, the temporary stay on enforcement will expire and the regulation requirements related to Sec. 22-19 and Sec. 22-21 of the City Code will resume enforcement.

ADOPTED by the Falcon Heights City Council this 11^h day of May, 2022

Moved by:		Approved by	/:
5		11 5	Randall Gustafson
			Mayor
GUSTAFSON	 In Favor	Attested by:	
LEEHY			Jack Linehan
MEYER ANDREWS WEHYEE	 Against		City Administrator
WEITTEL			